

## **Safe and Sensible Street Lighting Project - Review of Trial Switch-Off - Ashford District**

### **Sites originally proposed for inclusion in the trial switch-off but subsequently withdrawn:**

Ashford Road, Charing (5 lights)

### **Sites originally proposed for inclusion in the trial switch-off but subsequently modified to part-night lighting:**

None

### **Sites included in the trial switch-off:**

A20 Maidstone Road, Charing (6 lights)

A20 Maidstone Road, Tutt Hill/Hothfield (56 lights)

Charing Hill (16 lights)

A20 Maidstone Road, Ashford (2 lights)

Templer Way (6 lights)

Trinity Road (9 lights)

Romney Marsh Road (75 lights)

Site location	A20 Maidstone Road, Charing	Remarks
<b>No. of lights switched off</b>	6	-
<b>No. of lights converted to part night</b>	0	-
<b>Lights switched off/ converted (DATE)</b>	21/11/2013	-
<b>Police: crime and anti-social behaviour issues</b> Period: 21/11/2013-21/11/2014	One year period prior to switch-off: 4 crimes. One year period since switch-off: 3 crimes.	The information received from the Police does not differentiate between the three Maidstone Road sites in Ashford. However, there has been an overall reduction in crime, suggesting that the switch-off has not had an adverse impact.
<b>Police remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Crashes</b> (Jan 1994-Apr 2015)	Before switch-off: 2 SLIGHT (1998, LIGHT, LIT). After switch-off: None.	The absence of lighting at this site has not led to an increase in crashes.
<b>Traffic Schemes remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Enquiries received following implementation (site specific)</b>	None.	Kent's residents have not commented on these lights being switched off.
<b>Street Lighting</b>	Inventory shows columns installed in 1976.	At almost 40 years old, these columns are at, if not past, the end of their expected lifespan.
<b>Highway Operations</b>	No issues raised.	-
<b>Developments</b>	No issues raised.	-
<b>Other relevant issues</b>	There is a petrol garage adjacent to this site.	This should not factor into the recommendation as the garage possesses its own lighting.

<b>Has the trial switch-off had an adverse impact?</b>	<b>YES</b>		<b>NO</b>	✓
<b>Options and financial implications</b>	<b>Option</b>		<b>Cost over 15 years</b>	
	Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course)		£11,370	
	Convert to LED in due course, then switch back on		£11,220	
	Remove columns		£4,500	
<b>Remarks</b>	<p>The trial switch-off has not led to an increase in crime or crashes, and Kent's residents have not commented on these lights being switched off, suggesting that there is no need to continue providing lighting to this part of the highway.</p> <p>These columns are at the end of their lifespan, and removing them immediately will result in savings to Kent County Council of around £7,000 over the next 15 years, with further savings in the longer term.</p>			
<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Remove columns.</b>			
<b>JTB Remarks</b>	Members noted the report. No issues were raised.			
<b>Cabinet Committee Remarks</b>				
<b>Final Recommendation</b>				
<b>Cabinet Member Decision</b>		<b>Date</b>		

Site location	A20 Maidstone Road, Tutt Hill/Hothfield	Remarks
No. of lights switched off	56	-
No. of lights converted to part night	0	-
Lights switched off/ converted (DATE)	21/11/2013	-
<b>Police: crime and anti-social behaviour issues</b> Period: 21/11/2013-21/11/2014	One year period prior to switch-off: 4 crimes.  One year period since switch-off: 3 crimes.	The information received from the Police does not differentiate between the three Maidstone Road sites in Ashford. However, there has been an overall reduction in crime, suggesting that the switch-off has not had an adverse impact.
<b>Police remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Crashes</b> (Jan 1994-Apr 2015)	Before switch-off: 43 SLIGHT, 16 SERIOUS, 1 FATAL.  After switch-off: 22/02/2014 – SLIGHT. LIGHT. DRY. Veh 1 collided with rear of Veh 2. 20/04/2014 – SERIOUS. LIGHT. WET. Veh 1 collided with Veh 2 as Veh 1 tried to turn right. 18/06/2014 – SLIGHT. LIGHT. WET. Veh 1 (Cyclist) swerved into path of Veh 2, causing a collision. 25/09/2014 – SLIGHT. LIGHT. DRY. Veh 1 pulled out of layby causing Veh 2 to collide with side of Veh 1.	The absence of lighting did not play a part in any crashes after switch-off.
<b>Traffic Schemes remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Enquiries received following implementation (site specific)</b>	<b>Enquiry no. 17435352 05/12/2013</b> – complaint about Phase 1 switch-off at this site. Documents in links not found so not able to ascertain nature of complaint.	These enquiries were all received within the first month of the switch-off. Since then, no further enquiries have been received, indicating perhaps that residents are largely accepting of the change.

	<p><b>Enquiry no. 17016941 05/12/2013</b> – complaint about Phase 1 switch-off at this site. Road has no pavement and is dangerous for pedestrians.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 15806172 10/12/2013</b> – enquiry from former County Member Elizabeth Tweed regarding lights switched off on this site. Appreciates reasons behind the trial, but concerned for safety and large vehicles turning on this road.</p>		
<b>Street Lighting</b>	Inventory shows 52 of the 56 columns installed before 1975.	At 40 years old or older, most of these columns are at, if not past, the end of their expected lifespan.	
<b>Highway Operations</b>	No issues raised.	-	
<b>Developments</b>	No issues raised.	-	
<b>Other relevant issues</b>	None.	-	
<b>Has the trial switch-off had an adverse impact?</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	✓
<b>Options and financial implications</b>	<b>Option</b>	<b>Cost over 15 years</b>	
	Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course)	£103,720	
	Convert to LED in due course, then switch back on	£102,320	
	Remove columns	£42,000	
<b>Remarks</b>	The trial switch-off has not led to an increase in crime or crashes, and although a small number of enquiries were received within a month of the lights being switched off, none have been received since December 2013, suggesting that Kent's residents are largely accepting of the switch-off.		

Review of Trial Switch-Off - Ashford District

	Most of these columns are at the end of their lifespan, and removing them immediately will result in savings to Kent County Council of around £62,000 over the next 15 years, with further savings in the longer term. Taking this into consideration, it is recommended that these columns be removed.		
<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Remove columns.</b>		
<b>JTB Remarks</b>	Members noted the report. No issues were raised.		
<b>Cabinet Committee Remarks</b>			
<b>Final Recommendation</b>			
<b>Cabinet Member Decision</b>		<b>Date</b>	

Site location	Charing Hill	Remarks
<b>No. of lights switched off</b>	16	-
<b>No. of lights converted to part night</b>	0	-
<b>Lights switched off/ converted (DATE)</b>	21/11/2013	-
<b>Police: crime and anti-social behaviour issues</b> Period: 21/11/2013-21/11/2014	One year period prior to switch-off: None. One year period since switch-off: 4 crimes.	Compared to one year period prior to switch-off, crime has risen from no crimes to four.
<b>Police remarks</b>	Charing Hill has developed a crime problem since lighting was removed.	Noted.
<b>Crashes</b> (Jan 1994-Apr 2015)	Before switch-off: 18 SLIGHT, 5 SERIOUS. No reported crashes after switch-off date.	The absence of lighting at this site has not led to an increase in crashes.
<b>Traffic Schemes remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Enquiries received following implementation (site specific)</b>	<p><b>Enquiry no. 17016356 19/11/2013</b> – enquiry from customer expressing dissatisfaction with lights being switched off here.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17434877 20/11/2013</b> – customer unhappy about policy to switch off lights at this site. Explains there have been many deaths here over the years</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17531746 25/11/2013</b> – customer calling about a row of lights out on this road. Confirmed lights are in trial switch-off. Customer understood reasons but concerned for safety.</p>	Concentration of enquiries in the early months, but since then far fewer enquiries have been received, indicating perhaps that residents are largely accepting of the change.

	<p><b>Enquiry no. 17435066 26/11/2013</b> – enquiry from customer in support of S&amp;SSL scheme, but concerned about location of this site.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17435034 26/11/2013</b> – customer calling to express concern over the trial switch-off at this site. States many of the residents are elderly and is concerned for their safety.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17435438 09/12/2013</b> – enquiry from a customer reporting lights switched off, contrary to info on KCC’s website.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17435729 19/12/2013</b> – enquiry from same customer as above enquiry regarding lights in trial and condition of footpath</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17437639 29/01/2014</b> – customer extremely dissatisfied with switch-off of lights and condition of footpath on this site.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 15806847 18/03/2014</b> – Petition from customer calling for lights to be switched back on.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 141817 28/01/2015</b> – Resident asking for light to be removed now that it has been switched off, as it sways dangerously in the wind.</p>	
<b>Street Lighting</b>	Inventory shows these columns installed in 2001.	At 14 years old, these columns are just under half-way through their expected lifespan.
<b>Highway Operations</b>	No issues raised.	-
<b>Developments</b>	No issues raised.	-




<b>Other relevant issues</b>	None.		-	
<b>Has the trial switch-off had an adverse impact?</b>	<b>YES</b>	✓	<b>NO</b>	
<b>Options and financial implications</b>	<b>Option</b>		<b>Cost over 15 years</b>	
	Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course)		£11,120	
	Convert to LED in due course, then switch back on		£10,720	
	Remove columns		£8,000	
<b>Remarks</b>	<p>The increase in crime, and the concerns expressed by the police and by local residents, suggest that the trial switch-off has had an adverse impact on the local community.</p> <p>As the columns at this site are just under half-way through their expected lifespan, they are unlikely to need replacing within the next 15 years, so the cost of continuing to run them over this period would be only around £3,000 more than the cost of removing them. Taking this into consideration, it is recommended that these lights are switched back on immediately and converted to LED in due course.</p>			
<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course).</b>			
<b>JTB Remarks</b>	Members noted the report. No issues were raised.			
<b>Cabinet Committee Remarks</b>				
<b>Final Recommendation</b>				
<b>Cabinet Member Decision</b>			<b>Date</b>	

Site location	A20 Maidstone Road, Ashford	Remarks
<b>No. of lights switched off</b>	2	-
<b>No. of lights converted to part night</b>	0	-
<b>Lights switched off/ converted (DATE)</b>	21/11/2013	-
<b>Police: crime and anti-social behaviour issues</b> Period: 21/11/2013-21/11/2014	One year period prior to switch-off: 4 crimes. One year period since switch-off: 3 crimes.	The information received from the Police does not differentiate between the three Maidstone Road sites in Ashford. However, there has been an overall reduction in crime, suggesting that the switch-off has not had an adverse impact.
<b>Police remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Crashes</b> (Jan 1994-Apr 2015)	Before switch-off: 1 SLIGHT (1999) No reported crashes since switch-off.	The absence of lighting at this site has not led to an increase in crashes.
<b>Traffic Schemes remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Enquiries received following implementation (site specific)</b>	<b>Enquiry no. 17016746 29/11/2013</b> – Customer worried about trial switch-off site in regards to safety. <b>Enquiry no. 11002076 03/02/2014</b> – Letter from customer expressing concerns for switching off lights at this site, mainly safety.	Noted; however, whilst understandable, these concerns would not appear to be supported by the crash data.
<b>Street Lighting</b>	Inventory shows these columns as installed in 1994.	At just over 20 years old, these columns are around two-thirds of the way through their expected lifespan.
<b>Highway Operations</b>	No issues raised.	-
<b>Developments</b>	No issues raised.	-

<b>Other relevant issues</b>	None.		-	
<b>Has the trial switch-off had an adverse impact?</b>	<b>YES</b>		<b>NO</b>	✓
<b>Options and financial implications</b>	<b>Option</b>		<b>Cost over 15 years</b>	
	Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course)		£3,790	
	Convert to LED in due course, then switch back on		£3,740	
	Remove columns		£1,500	
<b>Remarks</b>	<p>There has been no increase in crime and no crashes since switch-off, and although two residents have expressed concerns about the safety of the switch-off, their concerns would not appear to be supported by the crash data.</p> <p>These two columns are over half-way through their expected lifespan and are likely to need replacing during the next 15 years, so removing them immediately will result in savings to Kent County Council of around £2,000 over this period, with further savings in the longer term. Taking this into consideration, it is recommended that these columns be removed.</p>			
<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Remove columns.</b>			
<b>JTB Remarks</b>	Members noted the report. No issues were raised.			
<b>Cabinet Committee Remarks</b>				
<b>Final Recommendation</b>				
<b>Cabinet Member Decision</b>			<b>Date</b>	

Review of Trial Switch-Off - Ashford District

Site location	Templer Way	Remarks
<b>No. of lights switched off</b>	6	-
<b>No. of lights converted to part night</b>	0	-
<b>Lights switched off/ converted (DATE)</b>	21/11/2013	-
<b>Police: crime and anti-social behaviour issues</b> Period: 21/11/2013-21/11/2014	One year period prior to switch-off: none reported. One year period since switch-off: none reported.	Trial switch off has not had an adverse impact.
<b>Police remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Crashes</b> (Jan 1994-Apr 2015)	Before switch-off: 1 SLIGHT (2006). No reported crashes since switch-off.	The absence of lighting at this site has not led to an increase in crashes.
<b>Traffic Schemes remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Enquiries received following implementation (site specific)</b>	<b>Enquiry no. 17440658 14/04/2014</b> – Customer giving feedback on lights switched off at this site. Expressed concern over lack of light. <b>Enquiry no. 17033212 12/12/2014</b> – Enquiry from same customer expressing same concerns. <b>Enquiry no. 15811085 2/10/15</b> - Enquiry from same customer expressing same concerns.	Noted.
<b>Street Lighting</b>	Inventory shows these columns as installed in 1999.	At 16 years old, these columns are around half-way through their expected lifespan.
<b>Highway Operations</b>	No issues raised.	-

<b>Developments</b>	No issues raised.		-	
<b>Other relevant issues</b>	None.		-	
<b>Has the trial switch-off had an adverse impact?</b>	<b>YES</b>		<b>NO</b>	
<b>Options and financial implications</b>	<b>Option</b>		<b>Cost over 15 years</b>	
	Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course)		£13,170	
	Convert to LED in due course, then switch back on		£13,020	
	Remove columns		£6,000	
<b>Remarks</b>	<p>Although there has been no increase in crime or crashes since switch-off, and few of the many people who use this road have expressed concerns, this trial site now appears anomalous in that it is a very short length of unlit road forming part of a network of lit roads in and around Ashford town centre.</p> <p>These columns are over half-way through their expected lifespan and are likely to need replacing during the next 15 years, so the cost of continuing to run them over this period would be around £7,000 more than the cost of removing them. Notwithstanding this, it is recommended that these lights are switched back on immediately and converted to LED in due course.</p>			
<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course).</b>			
<b>JTB Remarks</b>	Members noted the report. No issues were raised.			
<b>Cabinet Committee Remarks</b>				
<b>Final Recommendation</b>				

Review of Trial Switch-Off - Ashford District

<b>Cabinet Member Decision</b>		<b>Date</b>	
------------------------------------	--	-------------	--

Site location	Trinity Road	Remarks
<b>No. of lights switched off</b>	9	-
<b>No. of lights converted to part night</b>	0	-
<b>Lights switched off/ converted (DATE)</b>	21/11/2013	-
<b>Police: crime and anti-social behaviour issues</b> Period: 21/11/2013-21/11/2014	One year period prior to switch-off: 3 crimes. One year period since switch-off: 4 crimes.	Compared to one year period prior to switch-off, crime has risen from 3 crimes to 4.
<b>Police remarks</b>	Trinity Road has seen a rise in violence.	Noted.
<b>Crashes</b> (Jan 1994-Apr 2015)	Before switch-off: 1 SLIGHT (2008). No reported crashes since switch-off.	The absence of lighting at this site has not led to an increase in crashes.
<b>Traffic Schemes remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Enquiries received following implementation (site specific)</b>	<p><b>Enquiry no. 17016685 28/11/2013</b> – customer concerned about safety at this site.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17017165 11/12/2013</b> – customer expressing concerns over safety at this site. Agrees that lights should be off after midnight, but not all the time.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17017951 31/12/2013</b> – customer concerned about safety at this site, saying it is impossible to walk down it between 05:00 and 07:00. Offered assistance on alternatives to this trial.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17332698 13/01/2014</b> – customer concerned about safety at switch-off site.</p>	<p>Local residents have expressed strong concern about the trial switch-off of lighting in this area, and Kennington Community Forum has supported their concerns on the grounds that Trinity Road is used as a walking and cycling route between the residential area of Kennington and Eureka Leisure Park/Ashford town centre.</p> <p>The Community Forum has also raised the issue of future development increasing the number of vehicle and pedestrian/cyclist movements in this area so that lighting, if removed, would need to be replaced.</p>

	<p><b>Enquiry no. 17026071 15/07/2014</b> – complaint from customer demanding the lights are reinstated on this road.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 17234480 23/03/2015</b> – customer concerned about safety of late shift workers walking along this road.</p> <p><b>GovMetric Alert 07/06/2015</b> – customer extremely disappointed and dissatisfied with lights turned off at this site. Claims she does not feel safe walking along this road at night and many others feel the same. Advises she has to be driven instead of walking along this road, thus offsetting KCC’s energy saving goals.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 42001658 09/06/2015</b> – Customer concerned about lack of lighting at this site.</p> <p><b>Enquiry no. 15810497 24/07/2015</b> – Enquiry from Cllr Winston Michael stating he was told the lights switched off on this road will never be switched back on and will be removed. Councillor asking KCC to reconsider their decision and reinstate the lights at this site.</p>	
<b>Street Lighting</b>	Inventory shows these columns as installed in 1997.	At around 18 years old, these columns are just over half-way through their expected lifespan.
<b>Highway Operations</b>	No issues raised	-
<b>Developments</b>	No issues raised.	-
<b>Other relevant issues</b>	A pedestrian and cyclist survey carried out on Trinity Road supported the view that it is used as a walking and cycling route, with around 20 pedestrians and 10 cyclists per hour using it during the morning and late afternoon/early evening periods.	-



<b>Has the trial switch-off had an adverse impact?</b>	<b>YES</b>	✓	<b>NO</b>	
<b>Options and financial implications</b>	<b>Option</b>		<b>Cost over 15 years</b>	
	Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course)		£15,225	
	Convert to LED in due course, then switch back on		£15,030	
	Remove columns		£4,500	
<b>Remarks</b>	<p>Strong local opposition to the trial switch-off, supported by survey evidence that Trinity Road is used as a walking and cycling route, and police concerns about an increase in violent crime suggest that the trial switch-off has had an adverse effect on the local community. In addition, this trial site now appears anomalous in that it is a relatively short length of unlit road forming part of an otherwise lit route between Kennington and the centre of Ashford, and future developments appear likely to increase the need for lighting in this area.</p> <p>These columns are over half-way through their expected lifespan and are likely to need replacing during the next 15 years, so the cost of continuing to run them over this period would be around £11,000 more than the cost of removing them. Notwithstanding this, it is recommended that these lights are switched back on immediately and converted to LED in due course.</p>			
<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course).</b>			
<b>JTB Remarks</b>	Members noted the report. Councillor Wedgebury was pleased that lighting is being returned to Trinity Road.			
<b>Cabinet Committee Remarks</b>				
<b>Final Recommendation</b>				
<b>Cabinet Member Decision</b>			<b>Date</b>	

Site location	Romney Marsh Road	Remarks
<b>No. of lights switched off</b>	75	-
<b>No. of lights converted to part night</b>	0	-
<b>Lights switched off/ converted (DATE)</b>	21/11/2013	-
<b>Police: crime and anti-social behaviour issues</b> Period: 21/11/2013-21/11/2014	One year period prior to switch-off: 1 crime. One year period since switch-off: 1 crime.	Crime has remained at the same low level since the switch-off.
<b>Police remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Crashes</b> (Jan 1994-Apr 2015)	<p>Before switch-off: North: 3 SLIGHT (2000, 2004) Mid: 18 SLIGHT, 1 FATAL (2013) South: 6 SLIGHT, 1 SERIOUS</p> <p>After switch-off: North: none.</p> <p>Mid: 19/12/2014 – SLIGHT – <b>DARK</b>: V1 misjudged speed and path of V2 and collided with rear of V2, knocking it into V3. 20/06/2014 – SLIGHT – <b>LIGHT</b>: V1 collided with rear of V2 after V1 during change into lane 1.</p> <p>South: 28/11/2014 – SLIGHT – <b>LIGHT</b>: V2 slowing to merge with traffic in lane 2, V1 collided with read of V2.</p>	<p>The fatal crash before switch-off occurred during daylight hours.</p> <p>The pattern of crashes since the switch-off appears consistent with that before the switch-off, with no significant increase attributable to the lack of lighting.</p>

<b>Traffic Schemes remarks</b>	None.	-
<b>Enquiries received following implementation (site specific)</b>	None.	Kent's residents have not commented on these lights being switched off.
<b>Street Lighting</b>	Inventory shows the majority of these columns were installed in 1992, the remainder in 1995.	At 20 to 23 years old, these columns are around two-thirds of the way through their expected lifespan.
<b>Highway Operations</b>	No issues raised.	-
<b>Developments</b>	No issues raised.	-
<b>Other relevant issues</b>	None.	-
<b>Has the trial switch-off had an adverse impact?</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b> ✓
<b>Options and financial implications</b>	<b>Option</b>	<b>Cost over 15 years</b>
	Switch back on immediately (converting to LED in due course)	£164,625
	Convert to LED in due course, then switch back on	£162,750
	Remove columns	£75,000
<b>Remarks</b>	<p>The trial switch-off has not led to an increase in crime or crashes, and Kent's residents have not commented on these lights being switched off, suggesting that there is no need to continue providing lighting to this part of the highway.</p> <p>These columns are around two-thirds of the way through their expected lifespan, and removing them immediately will result in savings to Kent County Council of around £90,000 over the next 15 years, with further savings in the longer term.</p>	

Review of Trial Switch-Off - Ashford District

<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Remove columns.</b>		
<b>JTB Remarks</b>	Members noted the report. No issues were raised.		
<b>Cabinet Committee Remarks</b>			
<b>Final Recommendation</b>			
<b>Cabinet Member Decision</b>		<b>Date</b>	